



**University of
Zurich**^{UZH}

**Zurich Open Repository and
Archive**

University of Zurich
University Library
Strickhofstrasse 39
CH-8057 Zurich
www.zora.uzh.ch

Year: 2009

Book review: Carl Werner Müller: Legende - Novelle - Roman. Dreizehn Kapitel zur erzählenden Prosaliteratur der Antike; Göttingen, 2006

Baumbach, Manuel

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0075426900003244>

Posted at the Zurich Open Repository and Archive, University of Zurich

ZORA URL: <https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-30605>

Journal Article

Published Version

Originally published at:

Baumbach, Manuel (2009). Book review: Carl Werner Müller: Legende - Novelle - Roman. Dreizehn Kapitel zur erzählenden Prosaliteratur der Antike; Göttingen, 2006. *The Journal of Hellenic Studies*, 129:159-160.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0075426900003244>

Despite their focus on a single Herodotean book, the dozen chapters take such highly distinctive, even disparate, approaches that the result is a patchwork. The parts are successfully stitched together, however, by the editors' introduction, frequent cross-references among chapters and Henderson's concluding salvo, which intersects with many of the preceding interpretations. Overall, this collection reveals not so much about the *Histories* as about ways to read and question the work; it brilliantly demonstrates how Herodotus' versatile text resonates with the interests of 21st-century critics. In large measure, as indeed the title suggests, this volume gives us a Herodotus who takes shape and meaning in the minds and experience of his alert readers, ancient and modern.

DEBORAH BOEDEKER
Brown University
boedecker@brown.edu

MÜLLER (C.W.) **Legende – Novelle – Roman. Dreizehn Kapitel zur erzählenden Prosaliteratur der Antike.** Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2006, Pp. viii + 509. €89. 9783525257562.

This densely-researched volume consists of thirteen chapters on different forms of ancient prose narration dating from the sixth century BC to the sixth century AD. Five chapters (1, 2, 6–8), which are mainly devoted to Herodotus, are published for the first time, the rest are partly extended and revised versions of earlier publications on the following topics: the Parian inscription of the Archilochos-legend (chapter 3); Herodotus' novella of the treasury of Rhampsinit (chapter 4); the Herodotean Amasis-logos (chapter 5); Petron's story of the Ephesian widow, the Hellenistic Seleukos/Antiochos-novella in its transmission by Valerius Maximus, Plutarch, Appian and Lucian (chapter 10); the ancient Greek novel as genre (chapter 11); the implicit theoretical reflections on the novel in Chariton's *Callirhoe* (chapter 12); and the function of riddle in the *Historia Apollonii Regis Tyri* (chapter 13). Each chapter is self-contained and there is no introduction or conclusion reflecting on the book as a unit. However, Müller interlinks individual chapters with footnotes and provides his readers with a general index, which helps find common topics and passages discussed under different aspects.

The quality of the chapters is high. Müller critically discusses the relevant scholarship on his topics (even though some of the earlier articles would have benefited from further consideration of recent research in the field: the dating of Chariton on page 450, n. 19, for instance, does not take into account the new dating between 41 and 61 AD as suggested by Ewen Bowie, 'The chronology of the earlier Greek novels since B.E. Perry', *Ancient Narrative* 2 (2002) 47–63). Müller furthermore offers new readings of important pieces of ancient prose narration and contributes seminal observations to more general questions of date, function and reception of these texts in antiquity. Thus, Müller opens his book with a chapter entitled *Zur Frühgeschichte der erzählenden Prosaliteratur bei den Griechen*, in which he argues for the mercenary inscription of Abu Simbel as the first prose narration transmitted (590 BC) and combines his reading with a strong statement claiming that the late sixth century should be regarded as a century of broadly developed literacy (8). In this introductory chapter, Müller tackles broader questions of the tradition and development of ancient prose narration both in dialogue with and in opposition to the poetic and oral tradition. The topics and results of the four other new chapters can be summarized as follows.

Chapter 2 is a close reading of the famous Herodotean story of *Kleobis and Biton*, which combines an extensive discussion of the various traces of its setting in life ('Sitz im Leben') with a detailed narratological analysis. Müller correctly stresses the fact that the reason why Cleobis and Biton are 'only' the second example of happiness after Tellus can be found in the 'status of narrative reflexion' (73) the reader shares with the author Herodotus, i.e., the confrontation with material that is perceived only by hearsay and not by autopsy.

Chapter 6 on the Agariste-logos in Herodotus 6.126–131 (*Die dreizehn Freier der Agariste*) starts with an analytical reading of the presentation of the thirteen suitors of Kleisthenes' daughter Agariste in the text. Müller points out that the presentation is structured geographically in the form of *Ringkomposition* (247) starting from their journey to Sikyon from the far west (where the first suitor comes from) and ending in the west with the last suitor, Alkon. The careful structure of the presentation and the conflicting social implications of the agon (272) leads Müller to the conclusion that Herodotus used a lost source from the late

sixth century. Müller suggests that this source was a written prose text and not derived from poetic tradition for which no linguistic evidence can be found. His conclusion, that the (reconstructed) source had also been a novella (276), is a possible, but by no means conclusive, argument.

Chapter 7 (*Ehebruchsgeschichten*) contains a comparative analysis of four stories of adultery. Müller concentrates on Pherecydes' *Kephalos and Prokris* (fifth century BC) and Herodotus' two stories on Xerxes/Artaynte (book 9) and Gyges (book 1). Within Herodotus both stories serve to explain the downfall of the ruler or, respectively, his successors (301). Committing adultery is not primarily narrated as an (historical) fact but used as a narrative means and motive for activating the reader's imagination (308). However, with regard to the topic of adultery, the Gyges story does not fit the analysis in the first place as none of the three persons involved aims at committing adultery but rather at acting out different emotional states and interests; love and sexual desire are ascribed only to Kandaules, whose love for his wife is stressed (302). Consequently, Müller places this episode at the end of his analysis as a derivation from the 'Classical' form (300) and points at the reduction of the motive in the course of the Gyges tradition, as we can find in Plato's version in the *Politeia*, where committing adultery is a central aspect of the plot. One could add that this reduction has a narrative function within Herodotus as the Xerxes/Artaynte story can be read on the back of the Gyges narration, which precisely in being 'un-Classical' prepares for a Classical story of breaking marriage.

Chapter 8, *Der Tod des Intaphrenes*, draws on the literary tradition of the strong love between sisters and brothers, which surpasses other familiar bonds. Müller puts Herodotus' Intaphrenes story (book 3) in dialogue with Indo-iranian sources and the Dareios inscription of Bisutun (sixth century BC), and he shows parallels and differences, which point to the selective and creative usage of possible sources by Herodotus. As we do not know the common source of the Herodotus and the Indo-iranian versions (330) and as we can only speculate about his knowledge of the Bisutun inscription, the literary impact of the motif on Herodotus remains unclear. Its novelistic quality, however, is demonstrated by Müller in the first part of this chapter (310–18).

The volume is well edited. It is the first book on ancient narrative which comprises such a broad range of texts and covers such a wide space of

time. It can be regarded as an introduction to the field of Greek and Latin prose narration, since it not only tackles basic questions and aspects of different forms of ancient prose narration (*Legende – Novelle – Roman*) but also combines general topics with close readings of seminal texts. The volume will be appreciated not only by specialists but also by a wider audience as all Greek passages discussed are also presented in German translations.

MANUEL BAUMBACH
University of Zurich
manuel.baumbach@klphs.uzh.ch

MORRISON (A.D.) **The Narrator in Archaic Greek and Hellenistic Poetry.** Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007. Pp. xii + 358. £55. 9780521874502.

With its roots in rhetoric and Aristotelian formalism, narrative theory is attractive to many classicists. This book, a revised version of a UCL PhD thesis, applies the tools of narratology to an examination of the speaking voice in non-dramatic poetry from Homer to Apollonius. The project is both important and timely. Michèle Lowrie's readings of Horace have demonstrated the absolute (and very paradoxical) centrality of narrative and narration in lyric. With its analytical terminology and potential for precise attention to questions of structure, time, and the layering of voices and perspectives, narratology has much to add to our reading even of non-narrative poetry. Morrison's book also reflects a recent trend towards emphasising continuity between the performed poetry of the fifth-century 'song culture' and the 'book poetry' of Alexandria. Like other writers on this fascinating subject, he defines his project in terms of the poetics of allusion.

The book consists of five chapters. An introduction puts up the theoretical and historical scaffolding. A second chapter treats the speakers (or, as Morrison calls them, 'primary narrators') in 'Archaic' poetry (Homer, Hesiod and the *Hymns*, elegy and iambus, and monodic and choral song from Sappho and Alcman to Bacchylides and Pindar). It catalogues the tropes and devices which define the Archaic narrator's presence in the text he speaks, and discusses presentation of self in terms of knowledge, sincerity, authority, presence ('overtness'; 'intrusiveness'; 'pseudo-intimacy'; 'evaluative language'), mimesis ('pseudo-spontaneity'; 'self-correction') and self-