



**University of  
Zurich**<sup>UZH</sup>

**Zurich Open Repository and  
Archive**

University of Zurich  
Main Library  
Strickhofstrasse 39  
CH-8057 Zurich  
[www.zora.uzh.ch](http://www.zora.uzh.ch)

---

Year: 2011

---

**Cantons as policy laboratories of the Federal State? The diffusion of health insurance subsidy policies among the Swiss Cantons within a federal state**

Füglister, Katharina

Other titles: Policy laboratories of the federal state? : the role of intergovernmental cooperation in health policy diffusion in Switzerland

Posted at the Zurich Open Repository and Archive, University of Zurich  
ZORA URL: <https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-60934>  
Dissertation

Originally published at:  
Füglister, Katharina. Cantons as policy laboratories of the Federal State? The diffusion of health insurance subsidy policies among the Swiss Cantons within a federal state. 2011, University of Zurich, Faculty of Arts.

Katharina Füglistner

# **Policy Laboratories of the Federal State?**

The Role of Intergovernmental Cooperation in  
Health Policy Diffusion in Switzerland



# Contents

1	Introduction	13
1.1	Research design	15
1.1.1	The research questions and empirical context	15
1.1.2	Theory and hypotheses	18
1.1.3	Methodology and data	20
1.1.4	Findings	21
1.2	Contributions to the literature	22
1.3	Outline of the book	24
2	Theoretical Framework	27
2.1	Policy diffusion	27
2.2	Policy diffusion in federal states	30
2.2.1	Federal states: A particular environment for policy diffusion	30
2.2.2	Literature review of policy diffusion in federal states	33
2.3	Diffusion mechanisms	39
2.3.1	Competition	39
2.3.2	Emulation	41
2.3.3	Learning	43
2.3.4	Disentangling diffusion mechanisms	46
2.4	Networks and intergovernmental relations	47
2.4.1	Networks: Channels for policy diffusion and policy learning?	48
2.4.2	Intergovernmental institutions: Core elements of federal states	51
2.4.3	Literature review of networks, intergovernmental relations, and policy diffusion	52
2.5	General hypotheses	54
3	The Swiss Health-Care System	57
3.1	Main features	57
3.2	Development	59
3.3	Organization	63
3.3.1	Health insurance coverage	63
3.3.2	Actors and their roles	65
3.3.3	Managed competition: More regulation needed?	80

3.4	Health-care expenditures: An international comparison	85
3.5	Financing the Swiss health system	87
4	Health Insurance Subsidies	91
4.1	Subsidies: Social corrective to premiums	91
4.2	From generalized to individual subsidies	95
4.2.1	LAMA 1911: Subsidies for health insurers	95
4.2.2	LAMal 1994: Individual health insurance subsidies	103
4.2.3	Reforms and reform attempts at the federal level	104
4.3	Cantonal implementation: 26 systems	120
4.3.1	Dimensions of subsidy policies	120
4.3.2	Consequences of the heterogeneous system	127
4.4	Diffusion of health insurance subsidies: Hypotheses	133
5	Methods and Data	139
5.1	Methods for studying policy diffusion	139
5.1.1	Monadic approaches	140
5.1.2	Dyadic approaches	143
5.2	Model	152
5.3	Data	154
5.3.1	Dependent variable	154
5.3.2	Explanatory variables	156
6	Empirical Analysis	161
6.1	Descriptive statistics	161
6.1.1	Dependent variables	161
6.1.2	Explanatory variables	164
6.2	Analyses	168
6.2.1	Similarities other than geographic proximity matter	169
6.2.2	Policy and political outcomes matter	175
6.2.3	Role of intergovernmental institutions	180
6.3	Summary of findings	188
7	Conclusion	191
7.1	Findings from the empirical analysis	192
7.2	Broader implications for diffusion studies	195
7.3	Further research	197
A	Parliamentary Proposals	201
B	Robustness Checks	205

# List of Figures

3.1	Monthly premiums for adults 2009: Variation between insurers, cantons, and Swiss average	81
3.2	Evolution of indices: Health insurance premiums, consumer prices, and nominal wages, 1996–2008	82
3.3	Health-care expenditures and GDP per capita: OECD, 2007	86
3.4	Percentage point change in total health expenditures as a share of GDP. Switzerland, France, Germany, Sweden, United Kingdom, and United States, 1980–2007	86
3.5	Evolution of public health expenditures as a share of total health expenditures. United Kingdom, Sweden, France, Germany, Switzerland, and United States, 1960–2007	88
3.6	Evolution of private health expenditures: Insurance premiums, co-payments, and out-of-pocket payments, 1996–2007	90
4.1	Average monthly premiums for mandatory health insurance and average subsidies per beneficiary: Variation between cantons and evolution over time, 1996–2007	94
4.2	Effect of different eligibility models on the share of income spent on premiums	123
4.3	Evolution of cantonal identification of beneficiaries, 1997, 2000, 2004, and 2007	125
4.4	Evolution of cantonal payment modalities, 1997, 2001, 2004, and 2007	126
4.5	Evolution of cantonal use of the federal contribution, 1997, 2001, 2004, and 2007	128
4.6	Beneficiary rate and average amount of subsidies paid out to beneficiaries by canton, weighted by the use of the federal contribution, 2006	129
4.7	Share of subsidies spent on beneficiaries not entitled to social aid or supplementary financial assistance and average amount of subsidy paid out to beneficiaries by canton, weighted by the use of the federal contribution, 2005	131
4.8	Evolution of average premium per beneficiary remaining after subsidies and beneficiary rate, by canton, 1996–2007	132

6.1	Disaggregated dependent variable. Fraction of dyads in which canton <sub>a</sub> adopts a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> already adopted, for each year and each dimension of the subsidy policies	163
6.2	Fraction of dyads in which canton <sub>a</sub> adopts a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> already adopted, for each year. Aggregated dependent variable, all dimensions	165
6.3	Fraction of dyads in which canton <sub>a</sub> adopts a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> already adopted, for each year. Aggregated dependent variable (identification of beneficiaries and payment modalities)	165
6.4	Predicted probabilities that canton <sub>a</sub> imitates canton <sub>b</sub> as a function of the language similarity of the two cantons of the dyad	173
6.5	Predicted probabilities that canton <sub>a</sub> imitates canton <sub>b</sub> as a function of the absolute difference in the beneficiary rates of canton <sub>a</sub> and canton <sub>b</sub>	174
6.6	Predicted probabilities that canton <sub>a</sub> imitates canton <sub>b</sub> as a function of the party affiliation of the Director of Public Health	174
6.7	Predicted probabilities that canton <sub>a</sub> imitates canton <sub>b</sub> as a function of the percentage of left parties in cantonal government <sub>a</sub>	175
6.8	Predicted probabilities that canton <sub>a</sub> imitates canton <sub>b</sub> as a function of the number of initiatives voted in canton <sub>b</sub>	178
6.9	Predicted probabilities that canton <sub>a</sub> imitates canton <sub>b</sub> as a function of the degree of success of the subsidy policy in canton <sub>b</sub>	179
6.10	Marginal effects of a successful policy in canton <sub>b</sub> on the probability that canton <sub>a</sub> will adopt a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> has already adopted, as a function of joint membership in CDS	184
B.1	For each dimension of subsidy policy: Marginal effects of a successful policy on imitation as function of joint membership	217
B.2	Figure B.1 continued	218

# List of Tables

3.1	Allocation of main responsibilities for health-care at the federal, cantonal, and municipal level	69
3.2	Number of doctors by sector and specialization	72
3.3	Insurance plans within the mandatory health insurance (LAMal)	78
3.4	Table 3.3 continued	79
3.5	Cost of the Swiss health-care system by contributor, 2007	89
4.1	Health insurance subsidies: Maximum amount, budgeted amount, and paid-out amount, 1996–2007	93
4.2	Individual subsidy systems existing before 1995	97
4.3	Reform propositions concerning health insurance law, 1970–1994	101
4.4	Eligibility models used in 2007	121
5.1	Example of a directed dyadic dataset	148
5.2	Theoretical concepts and their operationalization	155
6.1	Descriptive statistics of all variables used	162
6.2	Members of the regional CDS	166
6.3	Members of the Board of the national CDS	167
6.4	Party membership of Cantonal Director of Public Health and Board of CDS in percentage, 1997—2007	168
6.5	Initiatives on subsidy policies voted by canton and year	168
6.6	Analysis of the effects of similarities: Coefficient estimates and standard errors of the logit analysis of the probability that canton <sub>a</sub> adopts a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> already has	171
6.7	Analysis of spread of policy and political success: Coefficient estimates and standard errors of the logit analysis of the probability that canton <sub>a</sub> adopts a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> already has	177
6.8	Analysis of the role of intergovernmental institutions for the aggregated model: Coefficient estimates and standard errors of the logit analysis of the probability that canton <sub>a</sub> adopts a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> already has	182

6.9	Analysis of the role of intergovernmental institutions and learning for each dimension: Coefficient estimates and standard errors of the logit analysis of the probability that canton <sub>a</sub> adopts a policy that canton <sub>b</sub> already has	186
6.10	Table 6.9 continued	187
B.1	Robustness checks for the analysis of the effects of similarities	207
B.2	Table B.1 continued	208
B.3	Table B.1 continued	209
B.4	Robustness checks for the analysis of the spread of policy and political success	210
B.5	Table B.4 continued	211
B.6	Robustness checks for the analysis of the role of intergovernmental institutions	212
B.7	Robustness checks for analysis of the role of intergovernmental institutions, for each dimension	213
B.8	Table B.7. continued	214
B.9	Table B.7 continued	215
B.10	Table B.7 continued	216